Saint Patrick’s Purgatory –
a fresco in Todi, Italy

Carla de Petris
University of Roma III (<depetris@uniroma3.it>)

Abstract
This essay deals with the tradition of the revelation of Purgatory to St. Patrick on Station Island in Lough Derg, whose popularity is testified not only in literary texts in the various languages of Medieval Europe but also in a unique work of art in the convent of the Sisters of Saint Clair at Todi, Umbria, a town along the Via Francigena, the road of medieval pilgrimages from Canterbury to Rome. It is a fresco which represents St. Patrick’s Purgatory, attributed to Jacopo di Mino del Pellicciaio, dated 1346. In 1974, following restoration carried out by Marcello Castrichini and Leonilde Dominici, the splendid fresco came to light again. The work was completed in 1985, but is not open to the public without special permit because it is located in the old refectory of the closed area of the convent. The fresco is discussed in some detail, comparing the forms and rituals of the Irish pilgrimage, the medieval legend of Owen to the life of Filippo Benizi, the Saint portrayed among the protagonists of the painting. In order to prove the ever-lasting popularity of the legend related to the Irish Saint in the same area another monument, the so-called ‘St. Patrick’s Well’ in Orvieto, designed by Antonio da Sangallo the Younger in 1527, is briefly referred to.

Keywords: St. Patrick, Purgatory, pilgrimage, Jacopo di Mino del Pellicciaio, Todi

The Birth of Purgatory (1986) by Jacques Le Goff invites us, beyond the remarkable historical investigation the work involves, to consider ‘the intermediate’. This monumental book, providing documentary evidence, demonstrates how the invention of Purgatory was by no means destined to affect Christians alone; how the slow birth of the ‘in-between’ was destined to cause debate concerning the binary schemata framing the whole of Western thinking which oscillates exclusively and obstinately between good and evil. Certainly the birth of an ‘in-between’, a third possibility, marked a major event in Western culture, which still seems, however, too reluctant to accept it.
There have been such significant changes since the beginning described by Le Goff, that we can speak actually of two different versions of Purgatory which have remained intertwined until quite recently. Le Goff briefly mentions the idea of the Purgatorial experience, known as ‘St Patrick’s Purgatory’, but disregarding the fact that Celtic religious thought, well before Christianity, was founded on the idea that the Other World and the concrete reality ran parallel and that there were places and times, spatial-temporal chinks beyond which one might transit from this world to that, as in the case of the pagan *Tir na nÓg*. The possibility of ‘raiding’ the Other World took the literary form of Aislingi which provided information about these visits to the Other World requiring suspension of conscience, a state analogous to that experienced during visions or dreams. The legend of ‘St Patrick’s Purgatory’ belongs to this kind of ‘in-between’ experience.

This original version of Purgatory, rooted in the Celtic myth but also already present in the Greek myth of Orpheus, with the advent of the proto-capitalist society at the beginning of the XIV century, evolved from an experience reserved to the repentant living – a return trip to the Other World thanks to which sins would be cancelled – to a sort of commercial transaction by which the prayers of the living – officially ratified by Rome in exchange for generous material offerings – could redeem the souls of the dead from the flames of Purgatory. In fact, in the year 1300, Pope Boniface VIII promulgated the Church’s first Jubilee year and through the concession of indulgences and public recognition of pilgrimages, he made the Church itself and the Papal See in Rome the object of the most important pilgrimage of Christianity. A very lucrative business indeed.

This mercantile conception of a relationship between this life and the Other World was finally rejected by Pope John Paul II, who, in the opening sermon of the Jubilee year of 2000 did not even mention Purgatory in connection with this pilgrimage to Rome. He hoped for a more earthly result. The ultimate aim of the pilgrims’ prayers that year was to convince the first world to remit the poor countries their debts. Therefore, it seems to me that in the XXI century we can finally dispose of this mercantile idea of Purgatory maintained by the Catholic Church down through the centuries.

On the contrary, the theme of this paper concentrates on a different, older and more fertile kind of Purgatory, that known as ‘St Patrick’s Purgatory’, i.e. a journey of the living through the country of the dead, a sort of Orphic experience, that has given us a wealth of great works of art from Dante’s *Commedia* (1308-1320) to Seamus Heaney’s *Station Island* (1984).

In the small town of Todi in Umbria there is a fresco where the Purgatorial experience ‘in the manner of St. Patrick’, is represented at extremely high artistic level. I thought of preparing an itinerary, a journey through geographically distant places, Lough Derg, Todi and Orvieto, all linked by this common theme. I shall provide only a few chronological and cultural references, because my ‘voyage’ is not so much literary as visual.
Had we sufficient time, many scholarly studies would help us trace the phases of the spread throughout Europe of the Irish legend of ‘St Patrick’s Purgatory’. This story, which Shane Leslie called «the Medieval best-seller», appears in several versions in various languages, even in the vulgar dialects of Tuscany, Lombardy and Veneto. Its impact upon Dante’s *Commedia* goes without saying.

We begin our journey departing from the historical figure of Saint Patrick, the first bishop of Ireland. The Saint merely inspired this legend as its immobile mover, in that the true protagonist of the story is a layman named Owein. We are told that Owein lived in the twelfth century, that is six hundred years later than the evangeliser of the troublesome Irish.

There is no reference, in fact, in the various ‘lives’ of the Saint of a direct vision of the other world. The legend narrates that, as the Saint was unable to move the hearts of the islanders, he went off to a ‘desert’ place on a mountain, i.e. Croagh Patrick. There Christ showed him a ‘moat’ where anyone who spent a night and a day there, moved by sincere repentance and faith, a) would be purged of all his/her sins and b) would be permitted to see the tortures meted out to the evil in Hell and the rewards given to the good in Heaven. The place was named as it is only because the saint was the first to whom it was revealed; it has been collocated by popular religious belief in Lough Derg (the Red Lake) on Station Island.

Let us now take a look at the true protagonist of the story: Owein. According to the legend, Owein, an Irish knight, whose moral conduct was not of the very best though his determination was adamant, entered the time-chink indicated by Saint Patrick in his day. The story is told by Matthew, Bishop of Paris in his *Chronica maiora* (1152). It is told again by Henry of Saltrey in his *Tractatus de Purgatorio Sancti Patricii* (ca. 1180-1184). The *Legenda Aurea* by Jacopo da Varazze, Bishop of Genoa, written from 1260 to 1298, provided a summary of the same story. In Jacopo da Varazze’s version the name of the protagonist is no longer Owein but one more familiar to Italians, Nicola.

Each version of the story tells how Purgatory was found, how the knight Owein arrived there, how, after a series of preliminary rites and acts of penitence, he was told by men dressed in white about the damned he would come across, the pains he would have to endure before reaching Paradise from which he would be excluded, the need to invoke the name of Jesus Christ in moments of peril, and how, despite all, he remained steadfast, he returned to the world of the living, cleansed of his sins. Those who were admitted to the mysterious cave in Lough Derg, on their return, were obliged to tell all they had heard and seen. These accounts were kept in the abbot’s archives, but not one of them has come down to us.

‘St. Patrick’s Purgatory’ became the only Irish sanctuary known all over Europe during the Middle Ages. A continuous flow of pilgrims, from the remotest regions, began to arrive in hopes of repeating Saint Patrick’s vision
and Owein’s experience. Among the pilgrims there were also a number of Italians who left reports. Many will be familiar with the ritual still performed on Station Island, so there is no need to describe it here (see Plate 2).

Another Irish legend is relevant here. Again in the XII century, when Owein’s story spread all over Europe, in the German town of Ratisbon, in a monastery associated with the mother-house of Cashel, a monk called Marcus wrote a Latin-language account of the visions of Tnuthgal, *Visio Tundali*. The final detail in the vision concerns the protagonist who sees a soul bearing an enormous weight as he walks over a hanging bridge thrown across a fiery abyss teeming with horrendous open-jawed monsters. The surface of the bridge is riddled with sharp nails, but the unfortunate sinner prefers to walk barefoot on these rather than fall a prey to the monsters below. Let us keep this bridge in mind for later.

From legend to real life now. A century after the ‘birth’ of the two Irish legends, in 1245, seven merchants from Florence founded the mendicant Order of the Servants of Blessed Mary or Servites (the Servites are still based in Rome and have a magnificent library where I was admitted to carry out some work). In 1254 Filippo Benizi, a medical student, entered the Order and thirteen years later was nominated General of the Servites and endeavoured to promote the Order in Italy and Germany. He was present at the Council of Lyon to defend his Order and died in odour of sanctity at Todi on the 22nd August 1285, in Saint Mark’s Monastery, later known as San Francesco al Borgo Nuovo. He was canonized in 1671, but immediately after his death, Filippo Benizi was venerated by the population of Todi to such a degree that his remains were transferred to a more imposing tomb in 1317, while a famous painter from Siena, Jacopo di Mino del Pellicciaio, was commissioned to paint a large fresco where the Saint is portrayed among the characters in the painting. In 1600 the monastery was bought from the Servites by the Sisters of Saint Clair, who not only hid the wall containing the fresco with the choir stalls they already had, but also plastered it over completely, except for the face of Saint Filippo (see Plate 3). Things remained so until 1974 when the large hall was refurbished and the fresco discovered and restored (see Plate 4).

I am now going to analyse the picture and seek answers to the questions that remain unanswered even today, by examining the painting in some detail.

The fresco of *Saint Patrick’s Purgatory*, dating from 1346, is undoubtedly the first, the largest and most complex known representation of ‘St Patrick’s Purgatory’. The fresco portrays the passage of souls from Purgatory to Paradise thanks to the mediation of the Madonna and of Filippo Benizi. The souls are received by Saint Peter, the ‘custodian’ of the Heavenly City.

The Purgatory is portrayed as the cross-section of a large mountain, where the souls expiate their offences according to the evil committed: we can see the ‘pits’ of the seven capital sins arranged according to the catalogue drawn up by Gregory the Great (ca. 540-604): greed, lust, pride, sloth, anger and envy; gluttony is missing due to damage to the fresco. The punishments are close to the
Dantesque concepts of ‘retribution’ and ‘analogy’, although the representations are more approximate and naïve. This representation of the seven mortal sins in seven grottos reminds us of the seven hermits who founded the Servite order on Monte Senario near Florence, the place of Filippo Benizi’s ordination.

The best preserved portrayals are those illustrating:

- **Superbia** (Pride) where the proud, frightened and clinging to each other, are surrounded by snarling monsters (see Plate 5);
- **Lussuria** (Lust) where the lustful lie in a bed of fire, while the demons punish them in the genitals (see Plate 6);
- **Accidia** (Sloth) where the slothful are obliged to walk over a gangway full of sharp nails. This is the terrible bridge narrated in Tnuthgal’s vision (see Plate 7).

The purified souls, men and women, now dressed in white, walk towards the Virgin who places garlands of flowers on their heads. Next to the Virgin stands Filippo Benizi wearing the beams of beatification. Beside him is Saint Peter, custodian of the Doorway, as he ushers the purified and crowned souls into the Heavenly City of Jerusalem (see Plate 8). The Madonna, wearing a rich mantle, is larger than the other figures to underline her importance; the twelve stars of the Apocalypse, etched in the blue sky, encircle her (see Plate 9).

Inside the city, above the walls, a benedicating Christ is surrounded by a host of angels, eleven to be exact. They represent the Apostles, Judas excluded (see Plate 10).

Above, in the Heavens, another host of angels looks on, well pleased. These splendid hosts of angels with polychrome wings are, practically, the signature of the artist, because Jacopo di Mino del Pellicciaio, always surrounded the central scenes of his paintings with hosts of jubilant or weeping angels. In fact, a Crucifixion of his is known as *The Weeping of the Angels*.

Above the mountain of Purgatory we can see Sanctus Patricius, Saint Patrick in bishop’s apparel who is allowing a man, the dominus Nicholaus, Nicola from the *Legenda Aurea*, to look through the opening of a round well at the souls being purged (see Plate 11).

The iconography of this Purgatory and the connection with the Servite Saint should not be overlooked because of the particularity of the case. First of all it must be pointed out that the patrons and the addressees of the message must have been very familiar with the legend, and other related stories. This can be evinced from the fact that the iconography was not based only on the *Legenda Aurea*, but also on the bridge and nails drawn from the *Visio Tundali*, Tnuthgal’s vision, which had been translated into Italian shortly before. The monks who commissioned the work had, obviously, every interest in placing the figures of both the Virgin and of Filippo Benizi at the centre of the painting; but why did they choose to collocate them within the representation of a legend so exotic and far removed from the reality of Todi as *St. Patrick’s Purgatory*? This is the main question to which no scholar, to my knowledge, has provided an answer yet.
I am inclined to think the monks wanted to kill three or four pigeons with one stone! To stick to the metaphor one pigeon had to do with advertising. As I said, in the year 1300, Pope Boniface VIII had promulgated the Church’s first Jubilee year and he had made Rome the object of the most important pilgrimage of Christianity. The Irish pilgrimage to ‘St. Patrick’s Purgatory’, so familiar in the Middle Ages, was an excellent ‘logo’ for pilgrims to Rome. Forty-six years after that first Jubilee, the Servites, attributed their Saint the role of ‘mediator’ between the Virgin and Saint Peter, placing the veneration of Filippo Benizi among the practices to carry out on the way towards the New Jerusalem, Rome.

Another reason strengthens the hypothesis of the promotional use of the fresco within the context of the mass phenomenon and major business venture, which the pilgrimage to Rome was destined to become. The Bishopric of Todi and Orvieto, in fact, marks the meeting-point, not far from Rome itself, of two great ‘pathways’ and several minor ‘pathways’ followed by pilgrims on their way to Rome: the Canterbury–Rome Francigena Way, the Romea Way joining Venice and Rome, the Via dell’Alpe di Serra (the Apennines), connecting the Emilian and Francigena ways, winding through the Apennine valleys.

The third reason for choosing the theme of ‘St. Patrick’s Purgatory’ for the fresco had to do directly with Filippo’s life. In fact, nobody seems to have noticed, to date, that at least one episode in the life of Filippo Benizi links him directly with it, in the sense of a return journey to Hell, a direct, physical experience of the underworld, and makes of him a latter-day Owein or Nicholas, depending on what one wishes to call him.

In the *Legenda arcaica* of 1305, the oldest version of Filippo’s life to be read – *legenda* – during the daily office, we are told that close to death Filippo grew pale and fainted. Upon opening his eyes again he said, «Dearest brothers, right now I have fought a tremendous battle against our old enemy [...] who accused me of losing myself forever within hell’s fire. But Christ and the Blessed Virgin Mary tore me from his grip and crowned me with an imperishable crown of glory».

To understand the iconography invented by Jacopo di Mino del Pellicciaio one has to bear in mind that the founding place of the Order of the Servites was Monte Senario in the area of Fiesole, near Florence. In fact, the seven founders, who were merchants, left Florence and its pomp in 1245 and took refuge on that hill, where they lived in seven grottos like hermits until a flock of followers who had gathered around them persuaded them to create a new Order based on absolute poverty. The seven grottos are still there and ironically or significantly they are seven like the seven mortal sins represented in the fresco. Even the name of the mountain has an interesting etymology supported by popular belief. *Senario* or *Sonario* or *Sonaio* means ‘resounding’ as it is said that the grottos threateningly echo every sound. A hellish experience. It was on Monte Senario that in the year 1254 the twenty-year old Filippo Benizi was ordered.
Monte Senario takes us also on a fascinating de-tour that suggests a further Irish connection with the Marian fresco in Todi. In fact, Maire Herbert, lecturer of Irish at UCC, in her article on the Irish *peregrini* to Italy, traces the spread of the cult of St. Brigit through Northern Italy into Tuscany, Fiesole and the surrounding area in particular, where the Irish scholar and bishop Donatus in A.D. 876 wrote a *Life of Brigit* in Latin including verses in praise of Ireland and affirming that Brigit «would be another Mary, mother of the great Lord».

Artists such as Jacopo make their own connections that the critics have the difficult job of tracing back, often following devious side-tracks. I am suggesting here that the artist who was given the task of celebrating the holy man, thought of representing the place of Filippo Benizi’s ordination, Monte Senario, a mountain with seven echoing grottos, as a version of ‘St. Patrick’s Purgatory’ of the *Legenda Aurea*, also because on that mountain the cult of Mary was closely associated to that of another Irish Saint, the Abbess Brigit, whose main preoccupation was the care of the poor and the outcast, as proclaimed in the Rule of the Order of the Servants of Blessed Mary.

The third and most interesting reason for the artist’s and his commissioners’ choice has to do with the important issue of how to finance this very expensive ‘interior decoration’ which, as it has been proved by experts, required Jacopo to spend over twenty days’ hard work on the fresco plaster. If we consider *dominus Nicholaus*’ wealthy clothes and his position next to the Irish bishop, we can presume that a man by the name of Nicola may have been the client we are looking for.

During the centuries that followed, legends were created that enhanced the connection between the Italian Saint Filippo Benizi and the idea of the pilgrimage to the Underworld as a redeeming journey. Most of the miracles narrated in the various versions of his life were performed while the beneficiaries were lying on his tombstone. In fact popular veneration of a tomb, that often brought about the necessity to build a larger and more important shrine (a church or a chapel) to allow for increasing flows of pilgrims, was referred to as *ad corpus*.

In a version of the *Liber Miraculorum* of Filippo Benizi of 1488 based on the original (ca. 1285-1290) written just after the Saint’s death, we read the story of Rysa, a woman possessed by demons, who came to the Saint’s tomb and «standing and sleeping on it – the tomb… or on him – the corpse!» vidit visibiliter ipsum sanctum venientem et eam sublevantem et excitantem a somno, et statim ei esse per os in dicto loco, et plene sanitati restituta est».

It is interesting to notice that this prodigious recovery occurred in the presence of «Nichola suo marito», her husband Nicola. Could he be the Nicholas who financed the fresco, or one of the as yet unknown clients?

A superabundance of legends and sites for further pious rites sprung from the legend represented in the Todi fresco. In fact if we finally travel a few miles from Todi, on the last leg of our journey, we come to Orvieto.

St. Patrick’s Well in Orvieto, the city’s water supply in case of prolonged siege, is 62 metres deep and contains two separate stairways of 248 steps each.
One is for descending, the other for ascending. They are connected by a small bridge suspended above the water which is about three metres deep. In the XVIII century, when the fortress became obsolete, the Servite monks of Orvieto, perpetrating a slick ‘commercial operation’ renamed Sangallo’s construction St. Patrick’s Well and elevated it to the status of Purgatory, promising remission of sin in exchange for contributions thrown into the water. We are back to the mercantile conception of Purgatory I mentioned at the beginning of my paper. During the Napoleonic period the Servites were expelled but the name of the well remained, along with the custom of throwing coins into the water, which are now collected for the benefit of the Municipality of Orvieto.

To silence and contrast this secular note I’ll conclude with Dante:

Io ritornai da la santissima onda […]
puro e disposto a salire alle stelle.¹²

I do hope, that like Dante, we now feel purged and ready to climb to the stars.

Notes

¹ A first and shorter version of this essay with black and white illustrations was published in Italian with the title La via per il ‘Purgatorio di San Patrizio’ passa per l’Umbria: da Lough Derg a Todi e Orvieto, in G. Pissarelo, G. Serpillo (a cura di), Purgatorio e Purgatori – Viaggi nella Storia, nell’immaginario, nella coscienza e nella conoscenza, ETS, Pisa 2006, pp. 95-114. We wish to thank Professor Marcello Castrichini for allowing us to reproduce the photos of the fresco after his excellent restoration.


⁵ The oldest recognised representation of the Saint – in a manuscript of the 13th Century now held at the Huntington Library, University of California (HM 3027, folio 40v) – is a version of Jacopo da Varazze’s Legenda Aurea, which circulated from the year 1260 on. Here Saint Patrick, while intent on converting a King to the Christian virtue of patience by telling him the story of the Passion, inadvertently pierces the royal listener’s foot with his pastoral staff. The king is thus converted.

⁶ A miniature (now in the Bibliothèque nationale de France, Paris) portrays Christ handing Patrick the pastoral staff while he shows him the hole/well-shaft leading down to Purgatory (see Plate 1).
The most complete and satisfactory study of the Todi fresco is still N. Mac Treinfhir, *The Todi Fresco and St. Patrick’s Purgatory, Lough Derg*, «Clogher Record», XII, 2, 1986, pp. 141-158. Unfortunately it contains interpretative mistakes concerning the iconography that later research has corrected.


M. Herbert, *Ireland, the Legacy of the Irish peregrini in Tuscany*, cit.  

The well was designed by Antonio da Sangallo il Giovane in 1527.

Dante, *Commedia*, Purgatorio XXXIII, vv. 142, 145.

Works Cited


——, *La leggenda del ‘Purgatorio di S. Patrizio’ fino a Dante e ai suoi commentatori trecenteschi*, «Studi Danteschi», LXV, 2000, pp. 177-201.

Foà Simona, Gentili Sonia (a cura di), *Dante e il locus inferni. Creazione letteraria e tradizione interpretativa*, Studi (e testi) italiani, IV, 1999.


Plate 1
Plate 5
Plate 11